



Good Ideas Are Not Enough: Michigan's Adult Learning System Needs More State Funding

Michigan's economic challenges are well known. Thousands of jobs in the automobile industry have been lost, and as of March, the state unemployment rate has led the nation for 35 out of the past 36 months.

Michigan is undertaking strategies at this time to diversify its economy and to replace the jobs lost in automobile manufacturing. Some of the new jobs will be in manufacturing (such as the production of alternative energy products), while others will be in the service sector and other sectors. Importantly, the success of Michigan's "green initiative" and other efforts to rebuild the economy will depend on whether there are a sufficient number of workers in the state who have the required skills or who can learn them easily.

Unfortunately, far too many Michigan workers lack the vocational skills needed by employers now and in the future, and a large number lack the basic skills required to learn these vocational skills. These workers remain unemployed or in low-wage jobs that do not pay enough to meet their expenses, and the shortage of skilled workers discourages businesses from starting up or relocating in Michigan.

While Michigan has made great strides in educating dislocated workers and other ready-to-learn workers with its No Worker Left Behind program, adults with very low basic skills in math, reading, or

language proficiency are often unable to enter these vocational programs. Nearly 400,000 working age adults in Michigan lack a high school diploma or equivalent, for example, and one in every 12 Michigan adults lack basic literacy skills. Such workers need to receive remedial education in one or more areas, either as a prerequisite to more advanced vocational training or concurrently with it.¹

Enrolling in adult education coursework is widely seen as the first step toward overcoming illiteracy and other barriers to employment. Besides providing individuals with the basic skills needed in the workforce, it gives them the foundation from which they can access more advanced vocational training to meet the increasing demands of the job market for higher skills. Investing in adult learning is necessary if Michigan is serious about upgrading the skills of its workforce, yet total funding for adult education plummeted from \$96 million in 2001 to just \$36 million in 2010, and the number of adults enrolled in the programs decreased by more than 50 percent during that time.

There is clearly a connection between the decline number of workers enrolling in and completing adult education and the drop in the amount-funding it receives. The stated mission of Michigan's adult education program is "to ensure that all adult learners obtain the highest quality education, leading to the

¹ No Worker Left Behind (NWLB) is the Granholm administration's initiative to double the number of Michigan workers trained for new careers within the state. It provides up to \$10,000 for two years' worth of education plus other supports for any unemployed or underemployed worker willing to study towards a degree or certificate leading to an in-demand job in Michigan. In the first 26 months, it has helped more than 102,000 workers enter into vocational training.

attainment of a secondary education, literacy, and numeracy skills necessary to succeed in employment and post-secondary education.”² Michigan’s adult education system can more readily accomplish this mission if steps are taken to ensure adequate funding.

Poverty and Unemployment in Michigan

A hard day’s work often does not yield a good day’s pay for many of today’s workers and their families, as many workers cannot make ends meet even with a full-time job. The result is that a significant number of full-time workers and their families are considered poor according to official federal measurements.

Many other workers, while earning enough that they are not considered poor, earn far below what is needed to attain *economic self-sufficiency*. This is defined as the ability of a family to meet all of its expenses on an ongoing basis without relying on government or private assistance. According to the Michigan League for Human Services’ economic self-sufficiency benchmark, a single parent with two children under age 6 must earn \$19.35 an hour, or \$40,252 per year, in order to be economically self-sufficient.³ However, the median hourly wages of the 20 lowest-paying occupations in Michigan range from only 39 percent to 46 percent of this amount.⁴ Many of these jobs do not provide health insurance or other benefits, adding to the financial strain on such families.

In addition to the fact that many full-time Michigan workers cannot support their families with the wages they earn, a significant number of families in Michigan are experiencing difficulty in finding work. In March 2010, Michigan had an unemployment rate of 14.1 percent, and has led the nation in unemployment for 35 out of the past 36 months.⁵ Many Michigan workers have exhausted or will soon exhaust their unemployment benefits due to having been unemployed for longer than the maximum number of weeks. Other workers,

while not losing their jobs entirely, have had their hours cut to part time.

Poverty and unemployment, in addition to creating hardships for families, exacerbate Michigan’s fiscal problems by reducing tax revenues and increasing the strain on Michigan’s social services programs. In addition, Michigan bears many indirect costs of poverty, including those associated with the need for special or remedial education and with higher crime rates.

Education as the pathway out of poverty

Just as it is a given that employment is the key to leaving poverty, it is also a given that the first step out of chronic unemployment or a dead-end job is the acquisition of marketable skills. The credential indicating mastery of essential reading, writing and mathematics skills has traditionally been a high school diploma (or an equivalent such as the GED). Without this credential, gainful employment is extremely difficult.

While possession of a high school diploma or equivalent is essential, most jobs that are expected to

Table 1

Median Earnings by Educational Attainment in Michigan, 2005		
	Age 25-44	Age 25-64
All education levels	\$36,691	\$39,748
Less than high school diploma	\$20,384	\$22,422
Just high school diploma	\$29,557	\$30,576
Some college but no degree	\$33,633	\$36,181
Associate’s degree only	\$40,768	\$40,768
Bachelor’s degree only	\$49,329	\$51,979
Graduate or professional degree	\$61,151	\$68,286

Note: Data represent persons with positive earnings working 35+ hours per week.
Source: U.S. Census Bureau, 2005 American Community Survey Public Use Microdata Sample File

² From the website of the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor and Economic Growth.

³ Michigan League for Human Services, *Economic Self-Sufficiency in Michigan: A Benchmark for Ensuring Family Well-Being*, May 2007.

⁴ Michigan League for Human Services, *Labor Day Report: Racial Wage Gap Grows in the Workplace*, September 2009.

⁵ U.S. Department of Labor Bureau of Labor Statistics, *Local Area Unemployment Statistics*.

Unemployment Rates in the United States, of the Civilian Noninstitutional Population 25 years and over by Educational Attainment, Sex and Race (February 2010)

Gender and Race	Less than a high school diploma	High school graduate, no college	Some college no degree	Associate's degree	Bachelor's degree or more
TOTAL	17.9	11.9	9.5	6.6	5.0
Men	19.0	14.1	10.7	8.0	5.4
Women	16.1	9.1	8.3	5.5	4.5
White	17.4	11.1	8.9	6.2	4.5
African American	24.4	17.5	13.0	10.0	8.2
Asian	15.0	8.5	8.7	4.7	6.4
Hispanic	15.6	12.7	10.0	7.4	5.4

Source: U.S. Bureau of Labor Statistics, "Employment and Earnings Online," March 2010.
Created by Michigan League for Human Services

be in demand in the near future require vocational credentials beyond that level. Such credentials include not only two-year, four-year and postgraduate degrees, but also recognized apprenticeships, vocational certificates and other indicators of postsecondary achievement. As expected, earnings increase significantly with a high school diploma and increase further with education beyond the diploma (Table 1). Likewise, unemployment decreases as the educational level rises (Table 2).

Unfortunately, many low-wage workers experience barriers to the vocational training that leads to adequately paying jobs. Some of the barriers are logistical (i.e. no public transportation available to jobs that match one's skills or to institutions that provide skills training), financial (i.e. not having enough money to pay for additional education and training or not having money for child care during evening class hours), or due to local economic factors (i.e. a shortage of higher-wage, higher-skill jobs in the areas where unemployed and low-wage workers live).

The Skills Gap

For many workers, however, the *primary* barrier to both good jobs and vocational training is an inadequate mastery of basic skills or literacy. A significant number

of Michigan adults have deficiencies in reading, writing and mathematics:

- In 2008, there were 388,925 Michigan adults in their prime working age (age 25-54) who lacked a high school diploma or equivalent (9.4% of all prime working age adults), according to the U.S. Census Bureau.
- In the same year, 25.7 percent of Michigan's working poor families had at least one parent without a high school diploma or equivalent (Table 3).
- Ten percent of working poor families have a parent who has difficulty speaking English.
- Moreover, 8 percent of adults in Michigan lack basic literacy skills, and in 10 counties that figure is 10 percent or more (Appendix A).

All of this suggests that a great number of high school graduates have literacy barriers and that using the possession of a high school diploma as an indicator of literacy proficiency may grossly understate the real situation.

Michigan is also facing a looming worker shortage. One well-known study predicts that by 2012 the state will have a shortage of 334,000 skilled workers

Adult Learning Needs of Michigan's Working Poor Families⁶

Working Poor Families with:	2004		2005		2006		2007		2008	
	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%	#	%
Parent without high school diploma or GED	26,665	31.3	24,960	28.3	24,550	28.0	26,190	29.3	25,505	25.7
No parent with any postsecondary education	46,545	54.6	50,860	58.0	48,550	56.0	52,690	58.9	51,010	51.4
Parent has difficulty speaking English	N/A	N/A	9,125	10.3	9,360	11.0	9,920	11.1	10,015	10.1

Source: 2008 American Community Survey microdata as supplied by the Working Poor Families Project

between the ages of 24 and 54.⁷ Part of the projected shortage is due to the retirement of baby boomers in the coming years and to the expected decrease in Michigan's working age population. Even after taking into consideration these two factors, however, a projected worker shortage despite record unemployment indicates a *skills gap*.

At a time when thousands of Michigan families are applying for unemployment benefits and public assistance, a significant shortage of skilled workers within a few years will have serious consequences for economic growth in Michigan. As workers who are not proficient in basic skills generally find themselves barred not only from higher-paying jobs, but from the vocational training needed to qualify for those jobs, Michigan needs to address basic-skill workforce deficiencies at least as seriously as it addresses deficiencies in high-tech skills.

The key to strengthening Michigan's workforce is to greatly increase the number of skilled workers. A strong adult learning system, well supported by state policy and funding, can do this. It can provide high school dropouts with an opportunity to acquire the skills

and credentials that meet the needs of employers, including providing a foundation by which workers can move on to advanced skills training. The challenge for state policymakers is to ensure that adult learning is affordable, accessible and effective.

The Effectiveness of Adult Education in Michigan

In Michigan, adult education programs are administered by local school districts and overseen by the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor and Economic Growth (DELEG). Programs fall under one of three categories: Adult Basic Education, Adult Secondary Education (which leads to a GED), and English as a Second Language (ESL). Each category is further divided into several levels (i.e. beginning, intermediate, advanced, etc.), and to move from one level to another, students must satisfactorily pass a standardized examination. To gauge program effectiveness, DELEG sets annual target goals for the percentage of participants successfully completing each educational level and the percentage achieving follow-up outcome objectives such as employment or further training.

⁶ A family in this analysis is a primary married-couple or single-parent family with at least one child under age 18 present in the household. A family is defined as working if all family members age 15 and over either have a combined work effort of 39 weeks or more in the prior 12 months OR all family members age 15 and over have a combined work effort of 26 to 39 weeks in the prior 12 months and one currently unemployed parent looked for work in the prior four weeks. A family is defined as poor if its combined household income is below the federal poverty threshold.

⁷ Lou Glazer and Donald Grimes, *A New Path to Prosperity? Manufacturing and Knowledge-Based Industries as Drivers of Economic Growth*, July 2004.

The adult education system has generally exceeded its completion targets for most educational levels. While this indicates that an acceptable percentage of adult education participants are successfully completing their programs, it says nothing about whether an adequate number of low-skill adults are enrolling in these programs in the first place. Given the seriousness of Michigan's skills gap, it must be asked whether the adult education system is reaching and serving enough of Michigan's low-skill and low-literacy adults. Is the state of Michigan, through adult learning, increasing credentials and skills enough to strengthen the workforce, reduce poverty, and reduce dependence on public assistance?

As mentioned previously, in 2008, nearly 389,000 Michigan adults in their prime working age lacked a high school diploma or equivalent. During the school year beginning that fall, however, only 28,243 residents in that age range, equivalent to 7.3 percent of prime working age adults without diplomas, were enrolled in adult education programs of any kind (and it is likely that some of those enrollees are high school graduates). Furthermore, the number of enrollees in beginning literacy programs (basic or ESL) fell by 75 percent between the 2001-02 and 2008-09 school years, despite the fact that 8 percent of Michigan adults lack basic literacy skills (Appendix B). A very large number of low-skilled adults who need adult education are not receiving it.

The 2003-04 school year, in particular, saw a drastic reduction in enrollment in most adult education programs. The number of adults enrolling in adult basic education and high school completion programs fell by 32 percent from the year before, and the number satisfactorily completing the programs fell by 13 percent (Table 4).

In light of the large number of Michigan adults without a high school diploma and/or with a low level of literacy, it is clear that despite the attainment of

established target percentages, the actual number of adult education enrollees and completers has been inadequate in nearly all categories.

The good news is that the current administration has been actively exploring ways to integrate adult education, postsecondary vocational training, work experience and barrier reduction, and to make such opportunities both more effective and more accessible. This has been done primarily through its Council on Labor and Economic Growth (CLEG), Michigan's state Workforce Investment Board that is required in order to receive federal money through the Workforce Investment Act (WIA). The council's Adult Learning Workgroup prepared a report that included recommendations for revamping Michigan's adult education system in ways that would maximize the ability of community colleges and other vocational training providers to provide adult basic education as a component of such training.⁸ Council committees are currently developing strategies for implementing the recommendations of the report, and the administration is currently looking at ways to expand No Worker Left Behind (a training program for dislocated workers) to address the needs of low-skilled adults. (This current effort is known as No Worker Left Behind: Everybody In!)

It was outside the scope of the CLEG report to address funding issues, however, and funding remains a significant barrier to providing the level of adult learning services recommended in the report. While the state is currently looking at ways to leverage federal dollars in order to integrate adult education into vocational "bridge" and "career pathway" programs, it is investing much less state money for this purpose than it did several years ago.⁹ While there are several ways to address basic skills deficiencies among those seeking vocational training (i.e., through remediation classes at community colleges or through on-the-job training), the current delivery system for adult education (through the K-12 school districts) is at present the most common

⁸ See *Transforming Michigan's Adult Learning Infrastructure: A Report to the Council for Labor and Economic Growth from the CLEG Low-Wage Worker Advancement Committee's Adult Learning Work Group*, available at http://www.michigan.gov/documents/mdcd/CLEG_Report_FINAL_249176_7.pdf. The Michigan League for Human Services was an active participant in the Adult Learning Workgroup and contributed significantly to this report.

⁹ For further discussion of bridge programs, career pathways, and strategies to increase access to adult learning programs, see the Michigan League for Human Services' *Fixing the Leaky Pipeline: Why Adult Education and Skills Training Matters for Michigan's Future*, July 2007.

Table 4

The Declining Number of Workers Enrolling in Adult Education Programs

Year	Enrolled	Total attendance hours	Number completed level	Number completed a level and advanced one or more levels	Number separated before completed	Number remaining within level	Percentage completing level
2000-01	56,001	5,328,869	15,471	7,760	22,877	17,653	27.63%
2001-02	75,988	8,488,809	23,922	936	24,761	27,305	31.48%
2002-03	70,893	7,653,370	17,496	7,038	27,114	26,283	24.68%
2003-04	48,273	7,429,957	15,280	6,588	11,763	21,230	31.65%
2004-05	34,768	5,851,463	11,210	3,536	11,846	11,712	32.24%
2005-06	32,024	5,055,266	10,229	3,139	12,437	9,358	31.94%
2006-07	32,856	5,012,035	12,293	4,256	12,318	8,245	37.41%
2007-08	30,571	4,413,014	11,866	3,587	14,718	3,987	38.81%
2008-09	28,243	3,185,745	11,265	3,470	13,410	3,568	39.89%
% change 2001-02 > 2008-09	-63%	-62%	-53%	271%	-46%	-87%	

Source: Michigan Adult Education Reporting System (MAERS) data from the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor and Economic Growth (DELEG)

way that low-skilled adults access basic skills education. As such, it needs to be adequately funded, even if funding mechanisms and delivery systems are changed in the future.

The Declining State Funding for Adult Education

Adult education in Michigan receives both federal and state funding, with the vast majority of funding coming from the state until the 2003-2004 program year. The federal funding comes from the U.S. Department of Education and is allocated through two grants.¹⁰ State funding for more than 30 years has been allocated via the State School Aid Fund, and as recently as Fiscal Year 1996, adult education received \$185 million per

year through that funding source. With the passage of Proposal A, adult education received its first major funding reduction. It went from being funded through the foundation allowance to being a categorical program with a set amount of funds. For the first several years after this funding formula change, adult education received \$80 million per year, a decrease of 57 percent. As inflation causes flat funding to erode in value over time, the ability of districts to keep up with their expenses during these years was further weakened.

The loss of funding resulting from Proposal A was only the beginning of the state's adult education funding reductions. After being reduced slightly for two years beginning in 2002, adult education funding was slashed by 75 percent in 2004 as part of an effort to address a

¹⁰ The larger and older grant is the *Adult Education Basic Grant*, which is the major source of federal support for basic skills programs and has as its stated purpose "to provide educational opportunities for adults over the age of 16, not currently enrolled in school, who lack a high school diploma or the basic skills to function effectively as parents, workers, and citizens." The other grant is the *English Literacy and Civics Grant*, which is allocated according to a formula based on state immigration levels and is intended to assist in the development of new program designs which support comprehensive ESL programs.

Table 5

Funding for Michigan's Adult Education Programs

Fiscal year	Program year	FEDERAL FUNDING			State funding	Total funding	State portion of funding
		Base grant	English literacy & civics grant	Total			
1996	1995-96	\$8,287,819	*	\$8,287,819	\$185,000,000	\$193,287,819	95.7%
1997	1996-97	\$11,482,416	*	\$11,482,416	\$80,000,000	\$91,482,416	87.4%
1998	1997-98	\$11,654,356	*	\$11,654,356	\$80,000,000	\$91,654,356	87.3%
1999	1998-99	\$11,973,584	*	\$11,973,584	\$80,000,000	\$91,973,584	87.0%
2000	1999-00	\$13,691,487	\$437,129	\$14,128,616	\$80,000,000	\$94,128,616	85.0%
2001	2000-01	\$15,159,503	\$1,160,594	\$16,320,097	\$80,000,000	\$96,320,097	83.1%
2002	2001-02	\$16,310,508	\$1,251,632	\$17,562,140	\$75,000,000	\$92,562,140	81.0%
2003	2002-03	\$14,679,457	\$1,332,464	\$16,011,921	\$74,569,800	\$90,581,721	82.3%
2004	2003-04	\$14,871,841	\$1,355,222	\$16,227,063	\$20,000,000	\$36,227,063	55.2%
2005	2004-05	\$14,755,635	\$1,352,236	\$16,107,871	\$20,000,000	\$36,107,871	55.4%
2006	2005-06	\$14,606,756	\$1,352,688	\$15,959,444	\$21,000,000	\$36,959,444	56.8%
2007	2006-07	\$14,606,750	\$1,369,315	\$15,976,065	\$24,000,000	\$39,976,065	60.0%
2008	2007-08	\$14,349,799	\$1,295,444	\$15,645,243	\$24,000,000	\$39,645,243	60.5%
2009	2008-09	\$12,914,820	\$1,300,460	\$14,215,280	\$24,000,000	\$38,215,280	62.8%
2010	2009-10	\$13,256,961	\$1,371,763	\$14,628,724	\$22,000,000	\$36,628,724	60.1%

Sources: U.S. Department of Education, Michigan Department of Education

projected budget deficit.¹¹ As a result, adult education received only \$20 million per year in state funds for Fiscal Years 2004 and 2005, bringing its total federal and state funding to only 39 percent of what it was in Fiscal Year 2003. State funding for adult education in the years since has wavered from \$21 million to \$24 million (Table 5).

The funding reduction has been painful. Many local providers have been forced to reduce or discontinue much-needed programs. This has especially hurt students in rural areas because of the longer distance that students are required to travel to participate in the programs that have been discontinued in their own

communities. The cuts have had the two-pronged effect of limiting the accessibility of surviving programs as well as reducing the number of vacant seats.

Enrollment data for the year immediately following the cuts (2003-04) indicates that the programs most negatively affected by the cuts are those serving students with the most barriers in the workforce, namely the ESL and Beginning Literacy programs (Appendix B).

Data on the demographics of adult education enrollees show that enrollment prior to the cuts had been stable or rising among many of the most vulnerable groups—the disabled, the unemployed,

¹¹ The 75 percent funding reduction was spread uniformly to all school districts.

adults on public assistance, low-income adults, single parents, and displaced homemakers—but had dropped very steeply following the budget cuts. Enrollment in many of these groups remains significantly lower than it was prior to the cuts (Appendix C).

In addition, enrollment for individuals aged 25-44, considered prime years for building career skills and the largest age group in adult education, had dropped by a full third from the previous year, and has fallen by 62 percent between 2001-02 and 2008-09. The decline in enrollment is also very stark among some minority groups, particularly African American males, for whom there was a 76 percent decrease in enrollment (Appendix D).

Given that the steep declines in enrollment and completion occurred in the two years immediately after the 75 percent reduction in funding, we can conclude that the funding cut has had a negative effect on the ability of low-skill adults to enroll in classes that could reduce their employment barriers and positively impact their economic future. Furthermore, as Table 3 shows, the state funding reduction has made Michigan much more reliant on federal funding than it was before. Federal budget deficits may eventually lead Congress to enact cuts in domestic spending, making Michigan's adult education programs even more vulnerable.

— RECOMMENDATIONS —

Michigan must invest in basic skills and literacy training that will keep workers employable, and enact policies that ensure access to such training by those who most need it. Such an investment will benefit not only workers who are unable to find a job, but those who are underemployed (part-time but desiring full-time work) and those who are trapped in low-wage employment. It will also benefit Michigan's businesses by helping to cultivate and retain an adequately skilled workforce that is ready to meet the changing needs of employers. Conversely, failure to make significant investment in adult learning will ensure the continued economic hardship of many families, will jeopardize Michigan's competitiveness in attracting new employers, and will put further strain on Michigan's safety net programs.

Michigan in the past several years has made great strides in connecting dislocated workers to vocational training opportunities through its No Worker Left Behind program. It is also taking important steps to integrate basic skills training with vocational training through bridge and career pathways programs, and through establishing regional consortiums by which key players (businesses, community colleges, K-12 districts and others) can more efficiently and effectively respond to adult learning needs. However, none of these important improvements in the adult learning system can be sustained without adequate funding.

Michigan currently relies on federal sources such as the Workforce Investment Act for much of its adult learning funding. Its state funding for adult learning is only a very small percentage of what it was 10 years ago, and the number of individuals that have enrolled in and completed basic skills programs has decreased as a consequence.

Now that Michigan has explored effective ways to more efficiently serve adults with basic skills deficiencies, the Legislature must be willing to commit additional money for this purpose. To ensure an adequate funding base in the future for adult education, Michigan needs to:

- Restore School Aid Fund Section 107 funding to at least the same level that it was in FY 2001-02.
- Develop a formula for increasing adult education funding to keep up with inflation, rather than maintaining it at a flat level, the value of which will erode over time.
- Monitor developments in federal adult education funding and be prepared for any federal funding cuts in the future.
- Advocate at the federal level for increased funding for adult education.
- Continue to examine current delivery systems and procedures to seek ways to maximize resources.

Appendix A

Estimated Percent in Each Michigan County Lacking Basic Prose Literacy Skills: Michigan 2003

(National Center for Education Statistics)

County	Population size ¹	Percent lacking basic prose literacy skills ²	County	Population size ¹	Percent lacking basic prose literacy skills ²
Michigan	7,629,134	8	Keweenaw	1,721	8
Alcona	9,723	9	Lake	9,262	11
Alger	7,383	9	Lapeer	69,519	7
Allegan	82,958	8	Leelanau	17,640	5
Alpena	24,509	7	Lenawee	75,194	8
Antrim	19,257	7	Livingston	131,876	4
Arenac	13,449	10	Luce	4,860	9
Baraga	6,521	8	Mackinac	9,276	8
Barry	45,486	7	Macomb	637,170	7
Bay	85,460	8	Manistee	19,703	8
Benzie	13,631	7	Marquette	50,255	6
Berrien	123,273	9	Mason	22,784	7
Branch	34,177	9	Mecosta	30,946	8
Calhoun	104,591	8	Menominee	19,911	9
Cass	40,140	8	Midland	64,437	6
Charlevoix	20,799	6	Missaukee	11,740	9
Cheboygan	21,759	8	Monroe	116,018	7
Chippewa	27,151	8	Montcalm	46,673	8
Clare	24,955	9	Montmorency	8,704	10
Clinton	51,732	6	Muskegon	128,146	8
Crawford	11,589	8	Newaygo	37,200	9
Delta	30,574	7	Oakland	932,922	7
Dickinson	21,410	8	Oceana	21,087	10
Eaton	82,368	5	Ogemaw	17,484	9
Emmet	25,376	6	Ontonagon	6,288	8
Genesee	333,153	10	Osceola	18,166	9
Gladwin	21,542	9	Oscoda	7,665	10
Gogebic	13,794	8	Otsego	18,904	7
Gr. Traverse	63,792	5	Ottawa	182,539	7
Gratiot	30,033	9	Presque Isle	11,751	8
Hillsdale	35,884	8	Roscommon	21,620	8
Houghton	26,782	8	Saginaw	157,577	10
Huron	27,858	9	Sanilac	34,317	9
Ingham	209,215	6	Schoolcraft	6,850	9
Ionia	44,961	8	Shiawassee	55,921	7
Iosco	21,743	9	St. Clair	130,608	7
Iron	10,212	9	St. Joseph	47,261	9
Isabella	48,228	7	Tuscola	44,897	7
Jackson	118,845	7	Van Buren	58,288	9
Kalamazoo	181,978	6	Washtenaw	252,410	6
Kalkaska	13,317	9	Wayne	1,500,757	12
Kent	435,012	8	Wexford	24,167	8

¹ Estimated population size of persons 16 years and older in households in 2003. Source: 2008 American Community Survey microdata

² Those lacking Basic prose literacy skills include those who scored Below Basic in prose and those who could not be tested due to language barriers. Source: U.S. Department of Education, Institute of Education Sciences, National Center for Education Statistics, 2003 National Assessment of Adult Literacy

Appendix B

Decrease in Adult Education Enrollment and Successful Completion, 2001-02 and 2008-09

Entering Educational Functioning Level (EFL)	2001-2002				2008-2009				Percent Change		
	Enrolled	Completed level	Completed level and advanced one or more levels	Percentage completing level	Enrolled	Completed level	Completed a level and advanced one or more levels	Percentage completing level	Enrolled	Completed level	Completed a level and advanced one or more levels
Beginning ABE Literacy	4,437	617	33	14%	1,116	450	224	40.3%	-75%	-27%	579%
Beginning Basic Ed.	5,169	1,099	33	21%	3,467	1,249	571	36.0%	-33%	14%	1630%
Low Intermediate Basic Ed.	4,818	1,403	32	29%	5,224	1,998	509	38.3%	8%	42%	1491%
High Intermediate Basic Ed.	28,827	9,355	138	32%	5,678	1,703	583	30.0%	-80%	-82%	322%
Low Adult Secondary Ed.	5,067	1,577	17	31%	2,036	619	0	30.4%	-60%	-61%	-100%
High Adult Secondary Ed.	5,408	2,201	4	41%	1,446	0	0	0.0%	-73%	-100%	-100%
Beginning ESL Literacy	3,450	1,347	122	39%	891	511	305	57.4%	-74%	-62%	150%
Beginning ESL	8,002	2,637	261	33%	816	545	270	66.8%	-90%	-79%	3%
Low Intermediate ESL	3,591	1,631	158	45%	1,927	1,177	466	61.1%	-46%	-28%	195%
High Intermediate ESL	3,589	1,277	101	36%	2,443	1,274	542	52.2%	-32%	0%	437%
Low Advanced ESL	2,722	503	25	18%	1,665	855	0	51.4%	-39%	70%	-100%
High Advanced ESL	908	275	12	30%	1,534	884	0	57.6%	69%	221%	-100%
Total	75,988	23,922	936	31%	28,243	11,265	3,470	39.9%	-63%	-53%	271%

Source: Michigan Adult Education Reporting System (MAERS) data from the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor and Economic Growth (DELEG)

Appendix C

Adult Education Enrollment by Participant Status, Program Type, Institutional Program, and Secondary Status Measure

	2000-01	2001-02	2002-03	2003-04	2004-05	2005-06	2006-07	2007-08	2008-09
Participant Status on Entry into the Program									
Disabled	1,227	1,726	1,502	956	677	715	833	999	986
Employed	21,330	26,323	22,830	14,307	11,093	9,749	10,476	9,314	8,507
Unemployed	19,592	26,067	28,635	17,181	12,743	12,447	13,788	13,450	13,407
Not in the labor force	22,117	23,598	19,428	16,785	10,932	9,828	8,592	7,807	6,329
On public assistance	2,953	6,163	6,027	3,794	2,310	3,778	4,833	4,769	5,706
Living in rural areas	5,297	5,619	5,736	4,766	3,633	3,599	3,335	3,071	2,845
Program Type									
In family literacy programs	359	438	147	583	36	148	87	121	79
In workplace literacy programs	453	734	473	234	51	26	33	36	62
In programs for the homeless	0	1	2	0	0	0	0	0	0
In programs for work-based project learners	0	3	5	1	1	1	1	0	0
Institutional Programs									
In correctional facilities	14,180	13,918	11,352	11,488	7,698	5,570	4,331	3,542	102
In community correctional programs	428	659	671	424	638	1,252	1,241	1,376	1,314
In other institutional settings	951	2,055	1,438	2,075	1,584	1,451	1,652	1,815	1,253
Secondary Status Measures (Optional)									
Low Income	4,095	12,929	13,101	8,990	4,906	9,545	9,944	8,976	10,710
Displaced homemaker	90	313	298	176	110	204	182	180	205
Single parent	1,327	5,452	5,197	3,495	2,024	2,611	3,229	3,258	3,570
Dislocated worker	95	435	515	294	147	391	441	470	704
Learning disabled adults	821	1,590	1,585	1,223	888	1,107	1,160	1,268	1,347

Source: Michigan Adult Education Reporting System (MAERS) data from the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor and Economic Growth (DELEG)

Appendix D

Adult Education Enrollment by Race

	American Indian or Alaskan Native		Asian		Black or African American		Hispanic or Latino		Native Hawaiian or Other Pacific Islander		White		Total
	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	Male	Female	
2000-01	306	284	921	2,047	12,392	6,397	4,857	3,511	50	97	13,642	11,497	56,001
2001-02	492	401	1,337	3,082	15,513	9,853	6,070	5,222	117	163	17,664	16,074	75,988
2002-03	395	362	7,510	3,458	7,901	9,877	5,554	4,952	89	150	15,596	15,049	70,893
2003-04	285	228	817	2,229	10,946	5,685	3,189	3,214	68	84	11,500	10,028	48,273
2004-05	236	199	647	1,724	7,251	3,566	2,724	2,601	35	43	8,201	7,541	34,768
2005-06	192	150	584	1,673	6,297	3,075	2,322	2,455	38	32	7,780	7,426	32,024
2006-07	195	159	644	1,727	5,857	3,907	2,501	2,612	39	35	7,376	7,804	32,856
2007-08	178	182	549	1,706	5,696	4,164	2,106	2,425	24	36	6,713	6,792	30,571
2008-09	173	189	622	1,645	3,776	4,476	1,944	2,441	22	37	5,858	7,060	28,243
Change 2001-02 > 2008-09	-65%	-53%	-53%	-47%	-76%	-55%	-68%	-53%	-81%	-77%	-67%	-56%	-63%

Adult Education Enrollment by Age

	16-18	19-24	25-44	45-59	60 and Older	Total
2000-01	2,008	17,144	28,755	6,157	1,937	56,001
2001-02	3,838	23,835	37,684	8,240	2,391	75,988
2002-03	3,644	21,484	35,096	8,219	2,450	70,893
2003-04	2,387	15,335	23,664	5,567	1,320	48,273
2004-05	1,269	11,001	17,225	4,313	960	34,768
2005-06	1,031	10,187	15,687	4,086	1,033	32,024
2006-07	1,040	10,175	16,345	4,214	1,082	32,856
2007-08	1,042	9,427	15,295	3,957	850	30,571
2008-09	679	8,506	14,363	3,881	814	28,243
Change 2001-02 > 2008-09	-82%	-64%	-62%	-53%	-66%	-63%

Source: Michigan Adult Education Reporting System (MAERS) data from the Michigan Department of Energy, Labor and Economic Growth (DELEG)